**Response to SRFB Review Panel October 2012 Comments**

**Project Number:** 12-1447

**Project Name:** Peshastin RM 8.8 Side Channel Reconnection Design

Review Panel Comments:

Evaluation criteria #4 applies to this project: The project has a high cost relative to the anticipated benefits and the project sponsor and lead entity have failed to justify the costs.

The design costs exceed the 30% A&E that is typical for restoration projects; the $199,000 design and permitting estimate are out of proportion with the estimated $420,000 - $600,000 construction estimate.

Has the County had WSDOT engineers review the conceptual alternatives and cost estimates? They seem low for two culverts under a busy state highway where the in-water work window will overlap with peak construction and tourist season and very little room for a detour exists within the project area. If in fact the construction costs are higher it may justify the relatively high design costs. A few items stand out in the budget as high that need additional justification: alternatives analysis when there are only two alternatives that will seemingly be most influenced by the hydraulic analysis, JARPA, impact analysis (what does this entail?), and ESA consultation (Limit 8 use would result in only consultation with USFWS and you could use the SPIF form if you have a Corps permit), design review is listed as both a stand-alone item and in the project management budget. Also in terms of milestone sequencing, typically a sponsor would seek input from stakeholders prior to submitting permit applications in case there is significant feedback that alters the project.

Sponsor Response:

Of the $199,900 identified in the project budget, only $128,200 is considered A&E Costs based on Manual 18 Definitions (See table below). In addition the $420,000-$620,000 construction cost estimate included in the final proposal was only based on construction contractor costs. Other costs associated with construction would include project management and coordination, project inspection by the design engineer, WSDOT inspection and coordination costs, and all re-vegetation costs for up to 5 separate crossings.

If construction contractor costs were $420,000 and that was added to the $71,700 identified in the table as falling under construction costs, the total for construction would be $491,700 before adding in any of the costs outlined above related to inspection, management, etc. Thirty percent of that number is $147,510. It is likely that overall construction costs including all elements mentioned above will actually be closer to $670,000, thirty percent of which is $200,000.

Alternatives analysis will include further development of the conceptual designs

 and include costs associated with presenting to landowners (including WSDOT), the Habitat Subcommittee and other stakeholders (design funders and possible construction funders.

JARPA, Impacts Analysis and ESA consultation costs are based on the sponsors past experiences permitting large scale projects associated with state highways and ensuing disruption to traffic. The impact of the this type of project often entails working outside of usual fish windows to minimize impacts to summer traffic (post labor day construction) complicating permitting and the use of programmatics.

Design review item is for payment to WSDOT. As part of CCNRD project management, design review takes up a significant amount of time.

**Design Cost Estimate**

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Item** | **Cost/unit** | **A &E Costs** | **Construction****Costs** | **Comments** |
| Alternatives Analysis | $7,500 | $7,500 |  | Includes presenting to stakeholders |
| Geotechnical Exploration | $21,000 |  | $21,000 |  |
| Topographic Survey | $21,000 |  | $21,000 |  |
| Preliminary Designs | $28,300 | $28,300 |  |  |
| Preliminary Design Report | $10,200 | $10,200 |  |  |
| Hydraulics Analysis | $5,300 | $5,300 |  |  |
| Project Permitting (JARPA) | $9,800 |  | $9,800 |  |
| Phase 1 Environ Assess | $8,000 |  | $8,000 |  |
| Cultural Survey and Report | $10,300 | $10,300 |  |  |
| Wetland Survey and Report | $11,900 |  | $11,900 |  |
| Impact Analysis | $3,500 | $3,500 |  |  |
| ESA Consultation | $3,600 | $3,600 |  |  |
| Agency Coordination |  $2,700 | $2,700 |  |  |
| Design Review | $2,700 | $2,700 |  | WSDOT Review |
| Final Plans and Specs | $29,100 | $29,100 |  |  |
| CCNRD Project Management, landowner coordination, admin, design review | $25,000 | $25,000 |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |
| Total |  | $128,200 | $71,700 | $199,900 |